

Judges' Guidance – Metalworking

For all entries: If you are not familiar with this type of art/science, can the entrant explain clearly the information you seek, based on their knowledge and research, in a verbal format?

Documentation:

- Does the documentation include a list of the materials, techniques and tools that used as well as dates of when types of materials, techniques, and tools were available to be used?
- Does it explain what the particular entry is and where and when it would have been used during period? Who would have created or used it?
- Are drawings, pictures, or diagrams included?
- Did the entrant cite examples, list sources, and include a bibliography? Are appropriate examples included?
- Does the entrant explain changes &/or compromises made in the creation of the item/s?
- Is the documentation organized, legible and well structured?

Complexity:

- Were tools and materials purchased or handmade?
- Is there difficulty of execution of the techniques used in conjunction with the metal and tools chosen?
- Were hand or power tools used and did the entrant explain why?
- Is the design an original, reproduction, commercial, or combination?

Creativity:

- Did the entrant make an exact copy of a period piece?
- Did the entrant base an original work on a period piece?
- How much did the entrant's piece differ from the original?
- Is the entry presented in a creative manner?

Authenticity:

- Has the entrant used pre-1600 style tools & methods, as well as appropriate pre-1600 materials to?
- Did the entrant develop it from a period source, use a modern translation, or is this an original work?
- To what degree has the entrant gone to use period tools, materials, and processes to make the entry?
 - If modern substitutes and/or methods were used, did the entrant explain why? Is the entrant knowledgeable about the methods and tools used in period (even if they chose not to use them)?
- Did it give the appearance and impression of period work appropriate to the stated time frame and geographic/cultural setting?

Aesthetic qualities:

- Is the product finished properly?

- Is it attractively presented?
- Does it look and feel the way it should?
- Has artistry been shown in the choice of materials used?
- Is the overall effect pleasing or useful?
- Is the overall appearance, design, color, and material combination suitable for a period piece?
- Is the piece neat and clean?
- Does the entry invite its use?
- Does the design fill the space in a pleasing manner?
- Is any attached hardware appropriate to the period of the piece?

Workmanship:

- Have the materials and techniques used produced a recognizable product?
- Are the tools, techniques, and materials used appropriate to the period of the item?
- If design is used, is it appropriate to the piece?
- Is the product appropriate to the desired result?
- Is it well-crafted and cleanly finished?
- Are the shapes and lines accurate?
- Is the work even?
- Are the joints well secured?
- Are pieces joined to the piece with suitable methods?
- Are edges and corners finished consistently?
- Is articulation smooth, flexible, and sturdy?
- Is the metal cracked?
- Is it consistent with known examples?